

ANDREW S. HUANG
REBECCA A. BERS
STEPHANIE DILWORTH
United States Department of Justice
Antitrust Division
450 Golden Gate Avenue
Box 36046, Room 10-0101
San Francisco, California 94102
Telephone: (415) 229-2901
andrew.huang@usdoj.gov
rebecca.bers@usdoj.gov
stephanie.dilworth@usdoj.gov

ALINA HABBA
Acting United States Attorney
ALEX D. SILAGI
Assistant United States Attorney
970 Broad Street, Suite 700
Newark, New Jersey 07102
Telephone: (973) 353-6001
alex.silagi@usdoj.gov

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY**

IN RE FRAGRANCE DIRECT
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

Civil Action No. 2:23cv-02174-WJM-JSA

IN RE FRAGRANCE INDIRECT
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

Civil Action No. 2:23cv-03249-WJM-JSA

IN RE FRAGRANCE END-USER
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

Civil Action No. 2:23cv-16127-WJM-JSA

This document relates to: ALL
ACTIONS

**JOINT STIPULATION AND
ORDER RE: LIMITED STAY OF
DISCOVERY**

Judge: William J. Martini

WHEREAS these consolidated civil cases allege a conspiracy to fix prices and restrain trade in the fragrance market globally and within the United States in violation of state and federal antitrust laws and state consumer protection and unjust enrichment laws;

WHEREAS there is an ongoing federal criminal antitrust investigation concerning the worldwide fragrances industry;

WHEREAS the Court granted the United States' Motion to Intervene for the purpose of seeking a limited discovery stay;

WHEREAS the parties and the United States have met and conferred regarding the parameters and scope of a limited stay of discovery; and

WHEREAS agreement by the Plaintiffs in the above-captioned actions to this Stipulation is conditioned upon the Court's entry of an amended scheduling order that defers the filing of amended complaints and briefing on any renewed 12(b)(2) motions until after expiration or termination of a stay of discovery with respect to the topics identified in Paragraphs 4 and 5 below;

NOW THEREFORE, PLAINTIFFS AND DEFENDANTS IN THE ABOVE-CAPTIONED CASES, AND THE UNITED STATES, BY AND

THROUGH THEIR UNDERSIGNED COUNSEL, HEREBY STIPULATE
AND AGREE AS FOLLOWS:

1. This Stipulation and Order shall be in effect in the above-captioned cases until February 15, 2026 (“Limited Stay Period”). During the Limited Stay Period, no discovery shall be conducted under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, except as set forth herein.

Permissible Subjects

2. During the Limited Stay Period discovery may proceed only on the following exhaustive list of Permissible Subjects. Discovery on the Permissible Subjects is still subject to the limitations of Paragraphs 3, 4, and 5.

(a) production of supply contracts relevant to the sale of fragrance ingredients and/or fragrance compounds (“Fragrance Products”) in the United States;

(b) discovery regarding the following information about formal meetings of trade associations, conferences, or conventions concerning Fragrance Products to be sold in the United States: (i) name(s) of meeting(s) or conference(s); (ii) dates of meeting(s) or conference(s); (iii) location(s) of the meeting(s) or convention(s); and (iv) names of employees in attendance;

(c) discovery from any non-party, except for: (i) any former party;
(ii) any present or former owner, in whole or in part, of a current or former Defendant; (iii) any entity presently or formerly, directly or indirectly owned, in whole or in part, by a current or former Defendant; (iv) any former officer, director, or employee of a current or former Defendant; and
(v) any current or former contractor or consultant engaged by a current or former Defendant;

(d) discovery regarding centrally-maintained transactional and statistical data (and pre-existing reports summarizing such data) regarding sales of Fragrance Products; if a party has no such data, discovery of records reflecting sales of Fragrance Products;

(e) discovery regarding corporate organizational structure, including organizational charts, parents, subsidiaries, affiliates, corporate divisions, control and management structure, generally;

(f) discovery regarding the existence and details regarding the storage, location, retention, destruction, and identification of documents and ESI;
and

(g) production of antitrust policies and manuals.

Discovery Limitations

3. At no point during this litigation shall any discovery be conducted that refers or relates to the government investigation concerning the fragrances industry, including but not limited to any party's or witness's communications with the United States.

4. During the Limited Stay Period, no discovery shall be conducted under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure that refers or relates in whole or in part to any understandings, agreements, meetings, or communications of any kind relating to sales or pricing in the fragrances industry, except:

- (a) as provided in paragraph 6 below;
- (b) as to supply contracts described in paragraph 2(a);
- (c) as to meetings as described in paragraph 2(b); and
- (d) to the extent such understandings or agreements are reflected in the transactional data described in paragraph 2(d).

5. No depositions may be taken during the Limited Stay Period, except for depositions of non-parties, as defined in paragraph 2(c).

Reservations

6. Nothing in this Stipulation shall prevent any party from: (i) serving interrogatories, requests for admission, requests for production, or non-party subpoenas on any subject; (ii) responding with written objections to discovery

requests on any subject; (iii) preserving documents and electronically stored information (“ESI”) requested by a party in discovery; and (iv) collecting documents and ESI responsive to written discovery during the Limited Stay Period.

7. Nothing in this Stipulation shall be construed as an admission that discovery of any Permissible Subject exists or is appropriate or discoverable under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, this Court’s orders, or other applicable rules or laws.

8. Nothing in this Stipulation shall be construed as an admission, agreement or acknowledgement about the scope of jurisdictional discovery.

9. The parties reserve all objections under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the Federal Rules of Evidence, this Court’s Local Rules, and all other applicable rules or laws.

10. Unless otherwise covered by the terms of the Stipulation, all discovery shall proceed in accordance with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, this Court’s Local Rules, and all other applicable rules or laws.

11. All written discovery requests and written responses shall be served on the United States at the same time as the receiving party.

12. During the Limited Stay Period, all parties and the United States retain the right to move the Court to modify, lift, or extend the stay, and to oppose any such

motion.

IT IS SO STIPULATED.

Date: August 13, 2025

/s/ Rebecca A. Bers
ANDREW S. HUANG
REBECCA A. BERS
STEPHANIE DILWORTH
Trial Attorneys
U.S. Department of Justice
Antitrust Division

*Counsel for Intervenor United
States of America*

/s/ James E. Cecchi

James E. Cecchi
**CARELLA BRYNE CECCHI
BRODY & AGNELLO, P.C.**
5 Becker Farm Road
Roseland, NJ 07068
Tel.: (973) 994-1700
jcecchi@carellabyrne.com

*Interim Liaison Counsel for
Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs*

/s/ Hilary Sherrer

Hilary Scherrer
HAUSFELD LLP
1200 17th Street N.W., Suite 600
Washington, DC 20036
Tel.: (202) 540-7200
hscherrer@hausfeld.com

Christopher M. Burke
BURKE LLP
402 West Broadway, Suite 1890
San Diego, CA 92101
Tel.: (619) 369-8244
cburke@burke.law

Linda P. Nussbaum
NUSSBAUM LAW GROUP, P.C.
1133 Avenue of the Americas, 31st Floor
New York, NY 10036
Tel.: (917) 438-9189
lnussbaum@nussbaumpc.com

*Interim Co-Lead Class Counsel for
Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs*

/s/ Kimberly A. Justice

**FREED KANNER LONDON
& MILLEN LLC**

Kimberly A. Justice (*pro hac vice*)
923 Fayette Street
Conshohocken, PA 19428
Telephone: 610/234-6486
kjustice@fklmlaw.com

**FREED KANNER LONDON
& MILLEN LLC**

Robert J. Wozniak, Jr. (*pro hac vice*)
Samantha M. Gupta (*pro hac vice*)
100 Tri-State International, Suite 128
Lincolnshire, IL 60069
Telephone: 224/632-4500
rwozniak@fklmlaw.com
sgupta@fklmlaw.com

/s/ Kellie Lerner

SHINDER CANTOR LERNER LLP

Kellie Lerner
14 Penn Plaza, 19th Floor
New York, NY 10122
646-960-8601
kellie@scl-llp.com

SHINDER CANTOR LERNER LLP

J. Wyatt Fore (*pro hac vice*)
Lindsay R. Maher (*pro hac vice*)
600 14th St. NW, 5th Floor
Washington, DC 20005
646-960-8612
wyatt@scl-llp.com
lmaher@scl-llp.com

*Interim Co-Lead Class Counsel for
End-User Plaintiffs*

/s/ Michael J. Flannery

Michael J. Flannery (*pro hac vice*)
**CUNEO, GILBERT & LADUCA,
LLP**

Two City Place Drive
St. Louis, MO 63141
Tel: (314) 226-1015
mflannery@cuneolaw.com

Evelyn Riley (*pro hac vice forthcoming*)

Daniel Cohen (*pro hac vice*)
Cody McCracken (*pro hac vice*)
**CUNEO, GILBERT & LADUCA,
LLP**

2445 M Street NW, Suite 740
Washington, DC 20037
Tel.: (202) 789-3960
evelyn@cuneolaw.com
danielc@cuneolaw.com
cmccracken@cuneolaw.com

Michelle J. Looby (*pro hac vice*)
Daniel E. Gustafson (*pro hac vice*)
Daniel C. Hedlund (*pro hac vice*)
Bailey Twyman-Metzger (*pro hac vice*)
GUSTAFSON GLUEK PLLC

120 South Sixth Street, Suite 2600
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Tel: (612) 333-8844
Fax: (612) 339-6622
mlooby@gustafsongluek.com
dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com
dhedlund@gustafsongluek.com
btwymanmetzger@gustafsongluek.com

*Interim Co-Lead Counsel for Indirect
Purchaser Plaintiffs*

/s/ Michael D. Fitzgerald

Michael D. Fitzgerald
**LAW OFFICES OF MICHAEL D.
FITZGERALD**

1 Industrial Way West, Unit B
Eatontown, NJ 07724
P.O. Box 1067
Oakhurst, NJ 07755
(202) 349-1482
mdfitz@briellelaw.com

*Interim Liaison Counsel for the End-
User Plaintiff*

/s/ Liza M. Walsh

Liza M. Walsh
Jessica K. Formichella
**WALSH PIZZI O'REILLY
FALANGA LLP**

Three Gateway Center
100 Mulberry Street, 15th Floor
Newark, New Jersey 07102
Telephone: (973) 757-1100
Facsimile: (973) 757-1090

Robert Milne (pro hac vice)
Martin M. Toto
William H. Bave, III (pro hac vice)

WHITE & CASE LLP
1221 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10020
Telephone: 212-819-8200
rmilne@whitecase.com
mtoto@whitecase.com
william.bave@whitecase.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Symrise AG,
Symrise Inc., and Symrise US LLC*

/s/ Sean P. McConnell

Sean P. McConnell
Sarah O'Laughlin Kulik
DUANE MORRIS LLP
30 S. 17th Street
Philadelphia, PA 19380
(215) 979-1947
spmccconnell@duanemorris.com
sckulik@duanemorris.com

D. Jarrett Arp (pro hac vice)
DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL LLP

1050 17th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 962-7000

jarrett.arp@davispolk.com
Arthur J. Burke (pro hac vice)
DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL LLP

450 Lexington Avenue
New York, NY 10017
(212) 450-4000
arthur.burke@davispolk.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Firmenich
Incorporated, Agilex Flavors &
Fragrances, Inc., DSM-Firmenich AG,
and Firmenich International SA*

/s/ Kevin R. Reich

Kevin R. Reich
GIBBONS P.C.
One Gateway Center
Newark, New Jersey 07102
Tel: (973) 596-4755
kreich@gibbonslaw.com

Aidan Synnott (pro hac vice)
Eyitayo St. Matthew-Daniel (pro hac
vice)
Hallie S. Goldblatt (pro hac vice)

/s/ Tansy Woan

Boris Bershteyn (*pro hac vice*)
Matthew Martino (*pro hac vice*)
Tansy Woan
Andrew Muscato
Evan Levicoff (*pro hac vice*)
**SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE,
MEAGHER & FLOM LLP**
One Manhattan West
New York, New York 10001
(212) 735-3000
Boris.Bershteyn@skadden.com
Matthew.Martino@skadden.com
Tansy.Woan@skadden.com
Andrew.Muscato@skadden.com
Evan.Levicoff@skadden.com

*Attorneys for Defendant International
Flavors & Fragrances Inc.*

Matthew P. Merlo (*pro hac vice*)
**PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND,
WHARTON, & GARRISON LLP**
1285 Avenue of the Americas
New York, New York 10019-6064
Tel: (212) 373-3000
asynnott@paulweiss.com
tstmatthewdaniel@paulweiss.com
hgolddblatt@paulweiss.com
mmerlo@paulweiss.com

Andrew C. Finch (*pro hac vice*)
John D. Buretta (*pro hac vice*)
Cristina M. Urquidi (*pro hac vice*)
**CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE
LLP**
375 Ninth Avenue
New York, New York 10001
Tel: (212) 474-1000
afinch@cravath.com
jlburetta@cravath.com
curquidi@cravath.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Givaudan SA,
Givaudan Fragrances Corporation,
Ungerer & Company, and Custom
Essence, LLC*

IT IS SO ORDERED:

s/Jessica S. Allen

Hon. Jessica S. Allen, U.S.M.J.

Date: August 26, 2025